The latest comments from members of the European Central Bank have suddenly given rise to rate cut fantasies. Don’t get carried away

Comments from ECB President Mario Draghi at yesterday’s ECB watchers conference have given rise to speculation about further easing, and were followed by further drops in bond yields. In his speech, Draghi said that “[we will continue monitoring how banks can maintain healthy earning conditions while net interest margins are compressed. And, if necessary, we need to reflect on possible measures that can preserve the favourable implications of negative rates for the economy, while mitigating the side effects.” At the same time, Draghi also added that “low bank profitability is not an inevitable consequence of negative rates”. These comments were also echoed by ECB Chief Economist Peter Praet and ECB Vice-President Luis de Guindos and got even more support from a Reuters story, quoting ECB sources that the ECB was investigating several options, including a so-called tiered deposit rate.

To bring or not to bring relief – the long discussion

Let’s try to put all these comments and rumours into perspective. The discussion on adverse side-effects on banks from the negative deposit rate is not new but has actually been ongoing for a long while. However, up to now, the ECB has been hesitant to present a clear-cut view or analysis. Press conferences since October last year have seen a kind of back-and-forth on this issue. Up to now, the overwhelming view has always been that negative interest rates have been good for the economy, with hardly any negative effects on banks. The latter part of this view has now started to shift, even though one should not forget that all targeted longer-term refinancing operations (TLTRO) up to now have been instruments to mitigate adverse side-effects on banks due to the built-in incentives. The discussion on whether there could be more to mitigate had already started in the run up to the March meeting, with speculation on combining new TLTROs with some relief, e.g. through hike(s) of the deposit rate or tiering systems.

This morning, in a recorded interview on Bloomberg TV, Peter Praet hinted that the ECB was indeed looking into possible options to mitigate the side-effects from negative interest rates but that there had to be a monetary policy case to justify any tiering. In our view, this is correct. There are currently much bigger challenges for banks’ profitability than the negative deposit rate, and a tiering system will not make an unprofitable bank suddenly profitable. Therefore, the ECB will have to investigate whether the negative deposit rate actually leads to a smaller (or more expensive) supply of loans than a zero deposit rate or a tiering system.

A tiering system? Some thoughts

There are at least four risks, in our view, to introducing a tiering system:

1. It could be perceived as a sign that the ECB is preparing for a “low for much longer” period
2. It could actually complicate the pass-through of monetary policy to the real economy; depending on the technical details of such a system
3. Rapid introduction of a tiering system could be perceived as yet another “free lunch” for the banking sector
4. While a tiering system would open the door to further rate cuts, these cuts would mainly be seen as exchange rate manipulation rather than supporting the bank lending channel
All in all, despite all the market excitement, all of these latest comments should be seen as an attempt by the ECB to demonstrate that it is not running out of ammunition. The most likely next step is still the announcement of the detailed conditions for the third batch of TLTROs (at the June meeting). Introducing a tiering system will be investigated but probably only announced in case the economy has not started to rebound by June. In fact, there is a balancing act between the details of the next TLTROs and a tiering system. The more favourable the conditions of the next TLTROs, the less urgent the need for mitigating measures. Consequently, we expect the ECB to remain rather cautious and not act hastily. Still, one thing is for sure: low interest rates for longer are the new reality.

Carsten Brzeski
Chief Economist ING Germany
+49 69 27 222 64455
carsten.brzeski@ing.de
Disclaimer
This publication has been prepared by the Economic and Financial Analysis Division of ING Bank N.V. ("ING") solely for information purposes without regard to any particular user's investment objectives, financial situation, or means. ING forms part of ING Group (being for this purpose ING Group NV and its subsidiary and affiliated companies). The information in the publication is not an investment recommendation and it is not investment, legal or tax advice or an offer or solicitation to purchase or sell any financial instrument. Reasonable care has been taken to ensure that this publication is not untrue or misleading when published, but ING does not represent that it is accurate or complete. ING does not accept any liability for any direct, indirect or consequential loss arising from any use of this publication. Unless otherwise stated, any views, forecasts, or estimates are solely those of the author(s), as of the date of the publication and are subject to change without notice.

The distribution of this publication may be restricted by law or regulation in different jurisdictions and persons into whose possession this publication comes should inform themselves about, and observe, such restrictions.

Copyright and database rights protection exists in this report and it may not be reproduced, distributed or published by any person for any purpose without the prior express consent of ING. All rights are reserved. The producing legal entity ING Bank N.V. is authorised by the Dutch Central Bank and supervised by the European Central Bank (ECB), the Dutch Central Bank (DNB) and the Dutch Authority for the Financial Markets (AFM). ING Bank N.V. is incorporated in the Netherlands (Trade Register no. 33031431 Amsterdam). In the United Kingdom this information is approved and/or communicated by ING Bank N.V., London Branch. ING Bank N.V., London Branch is subject to limited regulation by the Financial Conduct Authority (FCA). ING Bank N.V., London branch is registered in England (Registration number BR000341) at 8-10 Moorgate, London EC2 6DA. For US Investors: Any person wishing to discuss this report or effect transactions in any security discussed herein should contact ING Financial Markets LLC, which is a member of the NYSE, FINRA and SIPC and part of ING, and which has accepted responsibility for the distribution of this report in the United States under applicable requirements.