Opinion | 9 July 2020

New Horizons Hub

VoxEU: The world's poor cannot protect themselves well from the novel coronavirus

Recommendations to limit the spread of Covid-19 call for social distancing, washing, and access to information and treatment. However, the poor are less likely to have the kind of dwellings and infrastructure to follow Wold Health Organisation's recommendations, writes Caitlin Brown, Martin Ravallion, Dominique van de Walle for VoxEU.



Informal sector workers are particularly vulnerable

The World Health Organization and numerous national governments have made detailed recommendations on how people can best protect themselves from the new coronavirus.1 The prevailing recommendations have four main elements:

1. **Learning:** A fundamental requirement is to be able to receive reliable information on local disease incidence and protection measures. Compliance with this recommendation requires

- access to communication tools: radio, TV, phone, the internet.
- 2. Isolating: Social distancing (including lockdown as its extreme form) to lower the reproduction rate of the virus by reducing contacts per day. This requires both a personal behavioural response and suitable home-infrastructure. A dwelling with walls, a roof, and closures is desirable. In settings with large (often extended) families, intra-household transmission becomes more important; a sufficiently low density of people in the dwelling is advantageous. And there must be certain facilities: for example, you can't isolate as effectively if you have to leave the dwelling or yard to go to the toilet.
- 3. **Washing:** Regular handwashing with soap and water is strongly emphasised for protection from the virus. This too requires suitable facilities within the residence.
- 4. **Treatment:** If key symptoms (fever, difficulty breathing) develop, seeking medical help is advised. This requires physical access to health-care facilities.

The belief that these non-pharmaceutical measures can help contain the spread of illness is consistent with the available evidence. However, virtually all of these recommendations require household environments that support the capacity to protect from the virus – what we call the 'home environment for protection'.

The home environment for protection is the result of past wealth-constrained choices, and these are unlikely to change quickly. Dwelling attributes such as size, construction, and location (determining access to treatment) cannot be easily adjusted in response to the immediate virus threat; nor is health all that people care about when allocating their resources. All of the aspects of the home environment for protection are likely to be affected by wealth, meaning that poorer households have less capacity to follow WHO recommendations. This is to be expected between countries as well as within them.

Exacerbating matters are the likely behavioural responses to the WHO recommendations. Even if following all the recommendations is feasible given the dwelling and possessions, being poor in terms of income or wealth can be expected to reduce people's capacity to survive in isolation for anything more than a short period (as discussed further in Ravallion 2020).

For informal-sector workers in countries with limited social protection, staying home is likely to entail a potentially devastating loss of income. There is evidence that people in poorer regions reduced their mobility for work and other activities less than those in wealthier regions (Bargain and Aminjonov 2020). Poverty diminishes an individual's capacity to isolate and hence protect their family from the virus.

Thus, there is both a direct wealth effect on the capacity to socially isolate and an indirect effect via the attributes of the home environment that allow individuals to follow the recommendations for protection. Social protection policies responding to the pandemic focus primarily on the direct effect, by aiming to support consumption (especially of food) of the particularly needy while in isolation (Gentilini et al. 2020).

So what do we know about the indirect effect?

A key quote from the article:

The developing world, and especially its poorest half, is ill-prepared to protect itself from this virus. The recommendations that have been implemented on a massive scale in the rich world must be considered near fiction for the world's poor. Given the virus's infection rate, the likely degree of

exposure among a large segment of the population of the developing world also points to a serious concern for the entire population.

If poor families have a low health environment for protection, then complementary policies will be needed to help protect the poor from the virus. While challenges in supporting the food system as well as cash and food transfers have been emphasised in recent policy discussions, inadequate home environment for protection cannot be ignored.

The housing stock cannot be changed rapidly. But some things can be done now. The current infrastructure for information (particularly mobile-phone coverage) holds promise for getting out public health messages and information on how to access consumption support. Policies such as distributing or subsidising sturdy face masks, soap, and improved water access could be feasible in the near term and justified by both external benefits and equity impact. Home-grown innovative adaptations to the realities of life in the developing world will be crucial.

The full original article first appeared on VoxEU here on 27 June 2020

Author

Amrita Naik Nimbalkar

Junior Economist, Global Macro amrita.naik.nimbalkar@ing.com

Mateusz Sutowicz

Senior Economist, Poland mateusz.sutowicz@inq.pl

Alissa Lefebre

Economist <u>alissa.lefebre@ing.com</u>

Deepali Bhargava

Regional Head of Research, Asia-Pacific Deepali.Bhargava@ing.com

Ruben Dewitte

Economist +32495364780 ruben.dewitte@ing.com

Kinga Havasi

Economic research trainee kinga.havasi@ing.com

Marten van Garderen

Consumer Economist, Netherlands marten.van.garderen@ing.com

David Havrlant

Chief Economist, Czech Republic 420 770 321 486 david.havrlant@ing.com

Sander Burgers

Senior Economist, Dutch Housing sander.burgers@ing.com

Lynn Song

Chief Economist, Greater China lynn.song@asia.ing.com

Michiel Tukker

Senior European Rates Strategist michiel.tukker@ing.com

Michal Rubaszek

Senior Economist, Poland michal.rubaszek@ing.pl

This is a test author

Stefan Posea

Economist, Romania <u>tiberiu-stefan.posea@ing.com</u>

Marine Leleux

Sector Strategist, Financials marine.leleux2@ing.com

Jesse Norcross

Senior Sector Strategist, Real Estate jesse.norcross@ing.com

Teise Stellema

Research Assistant, Energy Transition teise.stellema@ing.com

Diederik Stadig

Sector Economist, TMT & Healthcare diederik.stadig@ing.com

Diogo Gouveia

Sector Economist diogo.duarte.vieira.de.gouveia@ing.com

Marine Leleux

Sector Strategist, Financials marine.leleux2@ing.com

Ewa Manthey

Commodities Strategist ewa.manthey@ing.com

ING Analysts

James Wilson

EM Sovereign Strategist James.wilson@ing.com

Sophie Smith

Digital Editor sophie.smith@ing.com

Frantisek Taborsky

EMEA FX & FI Strategist <u>frantisek.taborsky@ing.com</u>

Adam Antoniak

Senior Economist, Poland adam.antoniak@ing.pl

Min Joo Kang

Senior Economist, South Korea and Japan min.joo.kang@asia.ing.com

Coco Zhang

ESG Research coco.zhang@ing.com

Jan Frederik Slijkerman

Senior Sector Strategist, TMT jan.frederik.slijkerman@ing.com

Katinka Jongkind

Senior Economist, Services and Leisure Katinka.Jongkind@ing.com

Marina Le Blanc

Sector Strategist, Financials Marina.Le.Blanc@ing.com

Samuel Abettan

Junior Economist

samuel.abettan@ing.com

Franziska Biehl

Senior Economist, Germany <u>Franziska.Marie.Biehl@ing.de</u>

Rebecca Byrne

Senior Editor and Supervisory Analyst rebecca.byrne@ing.com

Mirjam Bani

Sector Economist, Commercial Real Estate & Public Sector (Netherlands) mirjam.bani@ing.com

Timothy Rahill

Credit Strategist timothy.rahill@ing.com

Leszek Kasek

Senior Economist, Poland leszek.kasek@ing.pl

Oleksiy Soroka, CFA

Senior High Yield Credit Strategist oleksiy.soroka@ing.com

Antoine Bouvet

Head of European Rates Strategy antoine.bouvet@ing.com

Jeroen van den Broek

Global Head of Sector Research jeroen.van.den.broek@ing.com

Edse Dantuma

Senior Sector Economist, Industry and Healthcare edse.dantuma@ing.com

Francesco Pesole

FX Strategist

francesco.pesole@ing.com

Rico Luman

Senior Sector Economist, Transport and Logistics Rico.Luman@ing.com

Jurjen Witteveen

Sector Economist

jurjen.witteveen@ing.com

Dmitry Dolgin

Chief Economist, CIS dmitry.dolgin@ing.de

Nicholas Mapa

Senior Economist, Philippines nicholas.antonio.mapa@asia.ing.com

Egor Fedorov

Senior Credit Analyst egor.fedorov@ing.com

Sebastian Franke

Consumer Economist sebastian.franke@ing.de

Gerben Hieminga

Senior Sector Economist, Energy gerben.hieminga@ing.com

Nadège Tillier

Head of Corporates Sector Strategy nadeqe.tillier@ing.com

Charlotte de Montpellier

Senior Economist, France and Switzerland charlotte.de.montpellier@inq.com

Laura Straeter

Behavioural Scientist +31(0)611172684 laura.Straeter@ing.com

Valentin Tataru

Chief Economist, Romania valentin.tataru@ing.com

James Smith

Developed Markets Economist, UK <u>james.smith@ing.com</u>

Suvi Platerink Kosonen

Senior Sector Strategist, Financials suvi.platerink-kosonen@ing.com

Thijs Geijer

Senior Sector Economist, Food & Agri thijs.geijer@ing.com

Maurice van Sante

Senior Economist Construction & Team Lead Sectors maurice.van.sante@inq.com

Marcel Klok

Senior Economist, Netherlands marcel.klok@ing.com

Piotr Poplawski

Senior Economist, Poland piotr.poplawski@ing.pl

Paolo Pizzoli

Senior Economist, Italy, Greece paolo.pizzoli@ing.com

Marieke Blom

Chief Economist and Global Head of Research marieke.blom@ing.com

Raoul Leering

Senior Macro Economist raoul.leering@ing.com

Maarten Leen

Head of Global IFRS9 ME Scenarios maarten.leen@ing.com

Maureen Schuller

Head of Financials Sector Strategy <u>Maureen.Schuller@ing.com</u>

Warren Patterson

Head of Commodities Strategy Warren.Patterson@asia.ing.com

Rafal Benecki

Chief Economist, Poland rafal.benecki@ing.pl

Philippe Ledent

Senior Economist, Belgium, Luxembourg philippe.ledent@ing.com

Peter Virovacz

Senior Economist, Hungary peter.virovacz@ing.com

Inga Fechner

Senior Economist, Germany, Global Trade inga.fechner@ing.de

Dimitry Fleming

Senior Data Analyst, Netherlands <u>Dimitry.Fleming@ing.com</u>

Ciprian Dascalu

Chief Economist, Romania +40 31 406 8990 ciprian.dascalu@ing.com

Muhammet Mercan

Chief Economist, Turkey muhammet.mercan@ingbank.com.tr

Iris Pang

Chief Economist, Greater China iris.pang@asia.ing.com

Sophie Freeman

Writer, Group Research +44 20 7767 6209 Sophie.Freeman@uk.ing.com

Padhraic Garvey, CFA

Regional Head of Research, Americas padhraic.garvey@ing.com

James Knightley

Chief International Economist, US <u>james.knightley@ing.com</u>

Tim Condon

Asia Chief Economist +65 6232-6020

Martin van Vliet

Senior Interest Rate Strategist +31 20 563 8801 martin.van.vliet@ing.com

Karol Pogorzelski

Senior Economist, Poland

Karol.Pogorzelski@ing.pl

Carsten Brzeski

Global Head of Macro <u>carsten.brzeski@ing.de</u>

Viraj Patel

Foreign Exchange Strategist +44 20 7767 6405 viraj.patel@ing.com

Owen Thomas

Global Head of Editorial Content +44 (0) 207 767 5331 owen.thomas@ing.com

Bert Colijn

Chief Economist, Netherlands bert.colijn@ing.com

Peter Vanden Houte

Chief Economist, Belgium, Luxembourg, Eurozone peter.vandenhoute@ing.com

Benjamin Schroeder

Senior Rates Strategist benjamin.schroder@ing.com

Chris Turner

Global Head of Markets and Regional Head of Research for UK & CEE chris.turner@ing.com

Gustavo Rangel

Chief Economist, LATAM +1 646 424 6464 gustavo.rangel@ing.com

Carlo Cocuzzo

Economist, Digital Finance +44 20 7767 5306 carlo.cocuzzo@ing.com