

# The problem with probability

With big-name speakers talking up the prospects of a global recession, we give this subject another look today. We are not alarmed.



## Recession - its a drag

With big-hitting names like Paul Krugman and Ray Dalio openly embracing the prospect of global recession, we take another look at this today.

Off-the-shelf models, such as the New York Fed probability of a US recession are, as we noted some days ago, pointing to a 24.6% probability of recession in 12 months time. Though as we also noted, even with a relatively good track record of predicting recessions, the model more recently has in recent years, been showing much lower probabilities 12 months before a recession, hitting only just over 11% on average 12M before a recession is indicated by the National Bureau of Economic Research (NBER). Such figures usually go on to rise to higher probabilities as recession draws closer, but the point is, they don't seem to be sending strong signals 12 months out.

12%

My estimate of the probability of US recession

12M forecast

## But surely...?

With these models proving a little hair-triggered (almost as binary as the recession event itself, nothing for ages and then Bam!) I decided to test whether there was any merit in respecifying the NY Fed's model. They use the 12m lag of the 3m-10Y spread as the sole variable in their regression. This is effectively a restricted version of a model in which the 3mth T-bill rate and 10Y bond yield were incorporated separately, and I thought it would be fun to see what happened to un-restrict the model (we economists certainly know how to have fun!).

## It doesn't help

The serendipitous finding of the exercise came from having a somewhat reduced sampling period than the NY Fed. My data feeds only started from 1986, theirs from the 1970s. Though this still gives me more than 30 years of monthly data, more than enough to draw firm conclusions. And the model works very nicely too, with 12M lags providing clear recession signals ahead of the actual events (see chart below). In fact, the model works rather better than the Fed model, with recent recessions coinciding with a 50% probability in 2 out of the three cases, and a 36% reading in one other case (not 11%!). There were no false signals. This contrasts with the much lower figures from the NY Fed model.

So conclusion one: there may well be a structural break (or several) in the NY Fed model, which they ought to take account of - it would not be surprising to find that the inference of a 3mth - 10Y yield spread had changed over the last fifty years. Think about how much economies have altered in this time. More data is not always better.

The subsequent test for the restriction on the NY Fed model proved to be a damp squib. So conclusion 2: There is virtually no difference between the restricted and unrestricted model in terms of data fit or the sum of squared errors. Without formally testing the restriction hypothesis, the eyeball test says, the restriction is valid.



## Probit model output - probability of recession

## So what percent probability of a US recession?

The final question is, if not 24.6% probability of US recession what probability is it? The answer is 12.3%. There is a long way to go yet before we need to worry, and that is based on the latest, flattest 3mth-10Y figures from this Friday's low 10Y yield figure filling in for the whole of March.

So what would we need to see to get a 50% recession probability reading? The 50% reading 12M before the 2008/2009 recession coincided with inversion of the 3mth-10Y yield of between 30 and 60bp. For 1990/1991, it was about -20 to -30bp. The current spread is closer to +20bp. Today, with the yield curve artificially flattened by the \$11tr or more of printed money by global central banks, I wouldn't be surprised if we needed to see something even more negative to draw recession conclusions.

So, to sum up: Krugman and Dalio might yet be right. And yield curve models can be useful, as they theoretically incorporate all of the information in all the macro newsflow, political noise and market expectations in a very small and efficient package. But these sort of models seem to be particularly sensitive to starting points and data periods, and my tinkering with the data suggests things aren't all that bad yet. Slowdown, as our US Economist, James Knightley is forecasting, looks likely. But recession? Case not proven.

#### Author

Amrita Naik Nimbalkar Junior Economist, Global Macro amrita.naik.nimbalkar@ing.com

Mateusz Sutowicz Senior Economist, Poland mateusz.sutowicz@ing.pl

Alissa Lefebre Economist alissa.lefebre@ing.com

#### Deepali Bhargava

Regional Head of Research, Asia-Pacific <u>Deepali.Bhargava@ing.com</u>

### **Ruben Dewitte**

Economist +32495364780 ruben.dewitte@ing.com

Kinga Havasi Economic research trainee <u>kinga.havasi@ing.com</u>

#### Marten van Garderen

Consumer Economist, Netherlands marten.van.garderen@ing.com

#### David Havrlant

Chief Economist, Czech Republic 420 770 321 486 <u>david.havrlant@ing.com</u>

Sander Burgers

Senior Economist, Dutch Housing sander.burgers@ing.com

## Lynn Song

Chief Economist, Greater China <u>lynn.song@asia.ing.com</u>

Michiel Tukker Senior European Rates Strategist michiel.tukker@ing.com Michal Rubaszek Senior Economist, Poland michal.rubaszek@ing.pl

#### This is a test author

**Stefan Posea** Economist, Romania <u>tiberiu-stefan.posea@ing.com</u>

Marine Leleux Sector Strategist, Financials marine.leleux2@ing.com

#### Jesse Norcross

Senior Sector Strategist, Real Estate jesse.norcross@ing.com

**Teise Stellema** Research Assistant, Energy Transition <u>teise.stellema@ing.com</u>

**Diederik Stadig** Sector Economist, TMT & Healthcare <u>diederik.stadig@ing.com</u>

**Diogo Gouveia** Sector Economist

diogo.duarte.vieira.de.gouveia@ing.com

Marine Leleux Sector Strategist, Financials marine.leleux2@ing.com

**Ewa Manthey** Commodities Strategist <u>ewa.manthey@ing.com</u>

**ING Analysts** 

James Wilson EM Sovereign Strategist James.wilson@ing.com

Sophie Smith Digital Editor

#### sophie.smith@ing.com

#### Frantisek Taborsky

EMEA FX & FI Strategist <u>frantisek.taborsky@ing.com</u>

#### Adam Antoniak

Senior Economist, Poland adam.antoniak@ing.pl

#### Min Joo Kang

Senior Economist, South Korea and Japan min.joo.kang@asia.ing.com

#### Coco Zhang

ESG Research <u>coco.zhang@ing.com</u>

## Jan Frederik Slijkerman

Senior Sector Strategist, TMT jan.frederik.slijkerman@ing.com

#### Katinka Jongkind

Senior Economist, Services and Leisure Katinka.Jongkind@ing.com

#### Marina Le Blanc

Sector Strategist, Financials Marina.Le.Blanc@ing.com

#### Samuel Abettan

Junior Economist samuel.abettan@ing.com

## Franziska Biehl Senior Economist, Germany Franziska.Marie.Biehl@ing.de

## **Rebecca Byrne** Senior Editor and Supervisory Analyst <u>rebecca.byrne@ing.com</u>

### Mirjam Bani

Sector Economist, Commercial Real Estate & Public Sector (Netherlands) <u>mirjam.bani@ing.com</u>

### **Timothy Rahill** Credit Strategist

#### timothy.rahill@ing.com

#### Leszek Kasek

Senior Economist, Poland leszek.kasek@ing.pl

Oleksiy Soroka, CFA Senior High Yield Credit Strategist oleksiy.soroka@ing.com

Antoine Bouvet Head of European Rates Strategy antoine.bouvet@ing.com

#### Jeroen van den Broek

Global Head of Sector Research jeroen.van.den.broek@ing.com

### Edse Dantuma

Senior Sector Economist, Industry and Healthcare edse.dantuma@ing.com

Francesco Pesole FX Strategist francesco.pesole@ing.com

**Rico Luman** Senior Sector Economist, Transport and Logistics <u>Rico.Luman@ing.com</u>

## Jurjen Witteveen Sector Economist jurjen.witteveen@ing.com

Dmitry Dolgin Chief Economist, CIS dmitry.dolgin@ing.de

## Nicholas Mapa

Senior Economist, Philippines nicholas.antonio.mapa@asia.ing.com

## Egor Fedorov Senior Credit Analyst egor.fedorov@ing.com

Sebastian Franke Consumer Economist

#### sebastian.franke@ing.de

Gerben Hieminga Senior Sector Economist, Energy gerben.hieminga@ing.com

Nadège Tillier Head of Corporates Sector Strategy nadege.tillier@ing.com

Charlotte de Montpellier Senior Economist, France and Switzerland <u>charlotte.de.montpellier@ing.com</u>

Laura Straeter Behavioural Scientist +31(0)611172684 laura.Straeter@ing.com

Valentin Tataru Chief Economist, Romania valentin.tataru@ing.com

James Smith Developed Markets Economist, UK james.smith@ing.com

Senior Sector Strategist, Financials suvi.platerink-kosonen@ing.com

Thijs Geijer Senior Sector Economist, Food & Agri thijs.geijer@ing.com

Maurice van Sante Senior Economist Construction & Team Lead Sectors <u>maurice.van.sante@ing.com</u>

Marcel Klok Senior Economist, Netherlands <u>marcel.klok@ing.com</u>

Piotr Poplawski Senior Economist, Poland piotr.poplawski@ing.pl

Paolo Pizzoli

Senior Economist, Italy, Greece paolo.pizzoli@ing.com

Marieke Blom Chief Economist and Global Head of Research <u>marieke.blom@ing.com</u>

Raoul Leering Senior Macro Economist raoul.leering@ing.com

Maarten Leen Head of Global IFRS9 ME Scenarios maarten.leen@ing.com

Maureen Schuller

Head of Financials Sector Strategy <u>Maureen.Schuller@ing.com</u>

Warren Patterson Head of Commodities Strategy Warren.Patterson@asia.ing.com

Rafal Benecki Chief Economist, Poland rafal.benecki@ing.pl

Philippe Ledent Senior Economist, Belgium, Luxembourg philippe.ledent@ing.com

Peter Virovacz Senior Economist, Hungary peter.virovacz@ing.com

Inga Fechner Senior Economist, Germany, Global Trade inga.fechner@ing.de

**Dimitry Fleming** Senior Data Analyst, Netherlands <u>Dimitry.Fleming@ing.com</u>

**Ciprian Dascalu** Chief Economist, Romania +40 31 406 8990 <u>ciprian.dascalu@ing.com</u> Muhammet Mercan Chief Economist, Turkey muhammet.mercan@ingbank.com.tr

## Iris Pang Chief Economist, Greater China iris.pang@asia.ing.com

Sophie Freeman Writer, Group Research +44 20 7767 6209 Sophie.Freeman@uk.ing.com

Padhraic Garvey, CFA Regional Head of Research, Americas padhraic.garvey@ing.com

James Knightley Chief International Economist, US james.knightley@ing.com

Tim Condon Asia Chief Economist +65 6232-6020

#### Martin van Vliet

Senior Interest Rate Strategist +31 20 563 8801 <u>martin.van.vliet@ing.com</u>

## **Karol Pogorzelski** Senior Economist, Poland

Karol.Pogorzelski@ing.pl

## Carsten Brzeski

Global Head of Macro carsten.brzeski@ing.de

Viraj Patel

Foreign Exchange Strategist +44 20 7767 6405 viraj.patel@ing.com

### **Owen Thomas**

Global Head of Editorial Content +44 (0) 207 767 5331 <u>owen.thomas@ing.com</u> Bert Colijn Chief Economist, Netherlands bert.colijn@ing.com

### Peter Vanden Houte

Chief Economist, Belgium, Luxembourg, Eurozone <a href="mailto:peter.vandenhoute@ing.com">peter.vandenhoute@ing.com</a>

## Benjamin Schroeder

Senior Rates Strategist <u>benjamin.schroder@ing.com</u>

### **Chris Turner**

Global Head of Markets and Regional Head of Research for UK & CEE <u>chris.turner@ing.com</u>

### Gustavo Rangel

Chief Economist, LATAM +1 646 424 6464 gustavo.rangel@ing.com

### Carlo Cocuzzo

Economist, Digital Finance +44 20 7767 5306 <u>carlo.cocuzzo@ing.com</u>