

## Does France have the fiscal space to counter the economic slowdown?

The French 2020 budget is off limits once again, but it is unlikely to be a problem at a time when the economy needs a push. However, Mario Draghi insisted this week that countries like France, with high debt levels, should keep some powder dry



Source: Shutterstock

### The ritual exchange of letters

This week, the European Commission sent a letter to France and Italy, expressing concern about their 2020 budget plans. In the case of France, the spending evolution scheduled for 2020 fails to comply with the structural effort promised (0.6pp of GDP vs 0.0pp scheduled) and with the debt reduction path previously settled. France was invited to react by giving more information on why it is the case before deciding on a qualification of this breach of the rules. France answered today that it is still determined to reach a budget balance (something which has not happen in any of the last 40 years), though just not right now...

Although there is a strong sense of “déjà vu” in the mail exchange between Bercy and Brussels, we think that a strong answer from Brussels is unlikely for the time being. Not only because the new European Commission is still to be confirmed, but also because the economic slowdown in the

Eurozone has pushed the European Central Bank to call for countries which “have fiscal space” to use it and help avoid a prolonged slowdown of the Eurozone economy.

## But what does fiscal space look like for France?

Looking at 2020 projected deficits throughout Europe, eight countries will have a budget surplus, including the Netherlands and Germany (+0.8% of GDP each). Taken together, if all Eurozone countries were to post a deficit of 2.5% in 2020, it would free almost €200 billion to support the economy compared to current plans. However, with the current plans, the fiscal thrust for the Eurozone should be very limited: a boost of 0.1pp or 0.2pp to GDP growth at the most.

With a forecasted deficit of 2.2% of GDP, France is – together with Spain (2%) and Italy (-3.5%) – in the bottom three. At least, these countries cannot be accused of not doing more to support growth. But should we expect more? In France, expenditures are already planned to grow by 2.6% in 2020, well above the recommended 1.2%, with public debt remaining just below the 100% threshold. This is a consequence of the “yellow vest” crisis which gave way to more supporting measures for households. It was made possible by lower interest rates: with the 10-year bond yield in negative territory, extra spending was made possible without derailing Emmanuel Macron’s debt reduction pledges completely. But there is a sense that some powder should be kept dry for the next downturn: doing that means that there is no fiscal space left.

## Be ready for the next downturn

In his last press conference at the ECB this week, Mario Draghi suggested that “countries where public debt is high, governments need to pursue prudent policies and meet structural balance targets, which will create the conditions for automatic stabilisers to operate freely”. In other words, the weather could turn rough, and some countries would be better leaving some fiscal space to automatic stabilizers. With the next economic downturn now at France's doors, it seems that there is just enough space for the stabilizers. Getting the pension reform done without giving up too much in short-term compensation will therefore be critical for the French Government to limit social unrest in the next two years.

### Author

#### **Olivia Grace**

Editor

[olivia.grace@ing.com](mailto:olivia.grace@ing.com)

#### **Julian Geib**

Junior Economist, Global Trade

[julian.geib@ing.de](mailto:julian.geib@ing.de)

#### **Zoltán Homolya**

Economic research trainee

[zoltan.homolya@ing.com](mailto:zoltan.homolya@ing.com)

#### **Amrita Naik Nimbalkar**

Economist, Global Macro

[amrita.naik.nimbalkar@ing.com](mailto:amrita.naik.nimbalkar@ing.com)

**Mateusz Sutowicz**

Senior Economist, Poland  
[mateusz.sutowicz@ing.pl](mailto:mateusz.sutowicz@ing.pl)

**Alissa Lefebre**

Economist  
[alissa.lefebvre@ing.com](mailto:alissa.lefebvre@ing.com)

**Deepali Bhargava**

Regional Head of Research, Asia-Pacific  
[Deepali.Bhargava@ing.com](mailto:Deepali.Bhargava@ing.com)

**Ruben Dewitte**

Economist  
+32495364780  
[ruben.dewitte@ing.com](mailto:ruben.dewitte@ing.com)

**Kinga Havasi**

Economic research trainee  
[kinga.havasi@ing.com](mailto:kinga.havasi@ing.com)

**Marten van Garderen**

Consumer Economist, Netherlands  
[marten.van.garderen@ing.com](mailto:marten.van.garderen@ing.com)

**David Havrlant**

Chief Economist, Czech Republic  
420 770 321 486  
[david.havrlant@ing.com](mailto:david.havrlant@ing.com)

**Sander Burgers**

Senior Economist, Dutch Housing  
[sander.burgers@ing.com](mailto:sander.burgers@ing.com)

**Lynn Song**

Chief Economist, Greater China  
[lynn.song@ing.com](mailto:lynn.song@ing.com)

**Michiel Tukker**

Senior UK & Eurozone Rates Strategist  
[michiel.tukker@ing.com](mailto:michiel.tukker@ing.com)

**Michal Rubaszek**

Senior Economist, Poland  
[michal.rubaszek@ing.pl](mailto:michal.rubaszek@ing.pl)

**This is a test author**

**Stefan Posea**

Economist, Romania

[tiberiu-stefan.posea@ing.com](mailto:tiberiu-stefan.posea@ing.com)

**Marine Leleux**

Sector Strategist, Financials

[marine.leleux2@ing.com](mailto:marine.leleux2@ing.com)

**Jesse Norcross**

Senior Sector Strategist, Real Estate

[jesse.norcross@ing.com](mailto:jesse.norcross@ing.com)

**Teise Stellema**

Research Assistant, Energy Transition

[teise.stellema@ing.com](mailto:teise.stellema@ing.com)

**Diederik Stadig**

Senior Economist, Healthcare & Technology

[diederik.stadig@ing.com](mailto:diederik.stadig@ing.com)

**Diogo Gouveia**

Sector Economist

[diogo.duarte.vieira.de.gouveia@ing.com](mailto:diogo.duarte.vieira.de.gouveia@ing.com)

**Marine Leleux**

Sector Strategist, Financials

[marine.leleux2@ing.com](mailto:marine.leleux2@ing.com)

**Ewa Manthey**

Commodities Strategist

[ewa.manthey@ing.com](mailto:ewa.manthey@ing.com)

**ING Analysts**

**James Wilson**

EM Sovereign Strategist

[James.wilson@ing.com](mailto:James.wilson@ing.com)

**Sophie Smith**

Digital Editor

[sophie.smith@ing.com](mailto:sophie.smith@ing.com)

**Frantisek Taborsky**

EMEA FX & FI Strategist

[frantisek.taborsky@ing.com](mailto:frantisek.taborsky@ing.com)

**Adam Antoniak**

Senior Economist, Poland  
[adam.antoniak@ing.pl](mailto:adam.antoniak@ing.pl)

**Min Joo Kang**  
Senior Economist, South Korea and Japan  
[min.joo.kang@ing.com](mailto:min.joo.kang@ing.com)

**Coco Zhang**  
ESG Research  
[coco.zhang@ing.com](mailto:coco.zhang@ing.com)

**Jan Frederik Slijkerman**  
Senior Sector Strategist, TMT  
[jan.frederik.slijkerman@ing.com](mailto:jan.frederik.slijkerman@ing.com)

**Katinka Jongkind**  
Senior Economist, Services and Leisure  
[Katinka.Jongkind@ing.com](mailto:Katinka.Jongkind@ing.com)

**Marina Le Blanc**  
Sector Strategist, Financials  
[Marina.Le.Blanc@ing.com](mailto:Marina.Le.Blanc@ing.com)

**Samuel Abettan**  
Junior Economist  
[samuel.abettan@ing.com](mailto:samuel.abettan@ing.com)

**Franziska Biehl**  
Senior Economist, Germany  
[Franziska.Marie.Biehl@ing.de](mailto:Franziska.Marie.Biehl@ing.de)

**Rebecca Byrne**  
Deputy Global Head of Editorial and Supervisory Analyst  
[rebecca.byrne@ing.com](mailto:rebecca.byrne@ing.com)

**Mirjam Bani**  
Sector Economist, Commercial Real Estate & Public Sector (Netherlands)  
[mirjam.bani@ing.com](mailto:mirjam.bani@ing.com)

**Timothy Rahill**  
Credit Strategist  
[timothy.rahill@ing.com](mailto:timothy.rahill@ing.com)

**Leszek Kasek**  
Senior Economist, Poland  
[leszek.kasek@ing.pl](mailto:leszek.kasek@ing.pl)

**Antoine Bouvet**

Head of European Rates Strategy  
[antoine.bouvet@ing.com](mailto:antoine.bouvet@ing.com)

**Jeroen van den Broek**  
Global Head of Sector Research  
[jeroen.van.den.broek@ing.com](mailto:jeroen.van.den.broek@ing.com)

**Edse Dantuma**  
Senior Sector Economist, Industry and Healthcare  
[edse.dantuma@ing.com](mailto:edse.dantuma@ing.com)

**Francesco Pesole**  
FX Strategist  
[francesco.pesole@ing.com](mailto:francesco.pesole@ing.com)

**Rico Luman**  
Senior Sector Economist, Transport and Logistics  
[Rico.Luman@ing.com](mailto:Rico.Luman@ing.com)

**Jurjen Witteveen**  
Sector Economist  
[jurjen.witteveen@ing.com](mailto:jurjen.witteveen@ing.com)

**Dmitry Dolgin**  
Chief Economist, CIS  
[dmitry.dolgin@ing.de](mailto:dmitry.dolgin@ing.de)

**Nicholas Mapa**  
Senior Economist, Philippines  
[nicholas.antonio.mapa@asia.ing.com](mailto:nicholas.antonio.mapa@asia.ing.com)

**Egor Fedorov**  
Senior Credit Analyst  
[egor.fedorov@ing.com](mailto:egor.fedorov@ing.com)

**Sebastian Franke**  
Consumer Economist  
[sebastian.franke@ing.de](mailto:sebastian.franke@ing.de)

**Gerben Hieminga**  
Senior Sector Economist, Energy  
[gerben.hieminga@ing.com](mailto:gerben.hieminga@ing.com)

**Nadège Tillier**  
Head of Corporate Sector Strategy  
[nadege.tillier@ing.com](mailto:nadege.tillier@ing.com)

**Charlotte de Montpellier**

Senior Economist, France and Switzerland  
[charlotte.de.montpellier@ing.com](mailto:charlotte.de.montpellier@ing.com)

**Laura Straeter**  
Behavioural Scientist  
+31(0)611172684  
[laura.Straeter@ing.com](mailto:laura.Straeter@ing.com)

**Valentin Tataru**  
Chief Economist, Romania  
[valentin.tataru@ing.com](mailto:valentin.tataru@ing.com)

**James Smith**  
Developed Markets Economist, UK  
[james.smith@ing.com](mailto:james.smith@ing.com)

**Suvi Platerink Kosonen**  
Senior Sector Strategist, Financials  
[suvi.platerink-kosonen@ing.com](mailto:suvi.platerink-kosonen@ing.com)

**Thijs Geijer**  
Senior Sector Economist, Food & Agri  
[thijs.geijer@ing.com](mailto:thijs.geijer@ing.com)

**Maurice van Sante**  
Senior Economist Construction & Team Lead Sectors  
[maurice.van.sante@ing.com](mailto:maurice.van.sante@ing.com)

**Marcel Klok**  
Senior Economist, Netherlands  
[marcel.klok@ing.com](mailto:marcel.klok@ing.com)

**Paolo Pizzoli**  
Senior Economist, Italy, Greece  
[paolo.pizzoli@ing.com](mailto:paolo.pizzoli@ing.com)

**Marieke Blom**  
Chief Economist and Global Head of Research  
[marieke.blom@ing.com](mailto:marieke.blom@ing.com)

**Raoul Leering**  
Senior Macro Economist  
[raoul.leering@ing.com](mailto:raoul.leering@ing.com)

**Maarten Leen**  
Head of Global IFRS9 ME Scenarios  
[maarten.leen@ing.com](mailto:maarten.leen@ing.com)

**Maureen Schuller**

Head of Financials Sector Strategy

[Maureen.Schuller@ing.com](mailto:Maureen.Schuller@ing.com)

**Warren Patterson**

Head of Commodities Strategy

[Warren.Patterson@ing.com](mailto:Warren.Patterson@ing.com)

**Rafal Benecki**

Chief Economist, Poland

[rafal.benecki@ing.pl](mailto:rafal.benecki@ing.pl)

**Philippe Ledent**

Senior Economist, Belgium, Luxembourg

[philippe.ledent@ing.com](mailto:philippe.ledent@ing.com)

**Peter Virovacz**

Senior Economist, Hungary

[peter.virovacz@ing.com](mailto:peter.virovacz@ing.com)

**Inga Fechner**

Senior Economist, Global Trade

[inga.fechner@ing.de](mailto:inga.fechner@ing.de)

**Dimitry Fleming**

Senior Data Analyst, Netherlands

[Dimitry.Fleming@ing.com](mailto:Dimitry.Fleming@ing.com)

**Ciprian Dascalu**

Chief Economist, Romania

+40 31 406 8990

[ciprian.dascalu@ing.com](mailto:ciprian.dascalu@ing.com)

**Muhammet Mercan**

Chief Economist, Turkey

[muhammet.mercan@ingbank.com.tr](mailto:muhammet.mercan@ingbank.com.tr)

**Iris Pang**

Chief Economist, Greater China

[iris.pang@asia.ing.com](mailto:iris.pang@asia.ing.com)

**Sophie Freeman**

Writer, Group Research

+44 20 7767 6209

[Sophie.Freeman@uk.ing.com](mailto:Sophie.Freeman@uk.ing.com)

**Padhraic Garvey, CFA**

Regional Head of Research, Americas

[padhraic.garvey@ing.com](mailto:padhraic.garvey@ing.com)

**James Knightley**

Chief International Economist, US

[james.knightley@ing.com](mailto:james.knightley@ing.com)

**Tim Condon**

Asia Chief Economist

+65 6232-6020

**Martin van Vliet**

Senior Interest Rate Strategist

+31 20 563 8801

[martin.van.vliet@ing.com](mailto:martin.van.vliet@ing.com)

**Karol Pogorzelski**

Senior Economist, Poland

[Karol.Pogorzelski@ing.pl](mailto:Karol.Pogorzelski@ing.pl)

**Carsten Brzeski**

Global Head of Macro

[carsten.brzeski@ing.de](mailto:carsten.brzeski@ing.de)

**Viraj Patel**

Foreign Exchange Strategist

+44 20 7767 6405

[viraj.patel@ing.com](mailto:viraj.patel@ing.com)

**Owen Thomas**

Global Head of Editorial Content

+44 (0) 207 767 5331

[owen.thomas@ing.com](mailto:owen.thomas@ing.com)

**Bert Colijn**

Chief Economist, Netherlands

[bert.colijn@ing.com](mailto:bert.colijn@ing.com)

**Peter Vanden Houte**

Chief Economist, Belgium, Luxembourg, Eurozone

[peter.vandenhoute@ing.com](mailto:peter.vandenhoute@ing.com)

**Benjamin Schroeder**

Senior Rates Strategist

[benjamin.schroeder@ing.com](mailto:benjamin.schroeder@ing.com)

**Chris Turner**

Global Head of Markets and Regional Head of Research for UK & CEE

[chris.turner@ing.com](mailto:chris.turner@ing.com)

**Gustavo Rangel**

Chief Economist, LATAM

+1 646 424 6464

[gustavo.rangel@ing.com](mailto:gustavo.rangel@ing.com)

**Carlo Cocuzzo**

Economist, Digital Finance

+44 20 7767 5306

[carlo.cocuzzo@ing.com](mailto:carlo.cocuzzo@ing.com)