

The world sweats during China's vacation

The impact of the policy-remedy to China's property market excesses is spreading across global markets. But they would bounce hard on any evidence of a mitigation plan from Beijing. We may have to wait for that though...



Source: Shutterstock

Any crumbs of comfort?

Markets across the world are selling off as the fear-gauge rises in response to the debt repayment problems of China's property development giant, Evergrande. And comparisons of this episode with past events are flying thick and fast. Is this LTCM? Is this Lehman's? Well, obviously it is neither. It is China and it is Evergrande. I find these comparisons somewhat unhelpful though I suppose it is natural that people gravitate towards them.

So are there any helpful remarks that can be made?

One is not to take too much comfort in the scale of Evergrande's outstanding debt as a proportion of GDP or any other yardstick. The sum usually quoted is around \$300bn. And yes, it is small compared to say Chinese GDP of \$14.3tr, amounting to only about 2% of that total.

But I remember similar calculations leading you to draw the wrong conclusions in the past. In 2007 I read, and then disappointingly related to colleagues, a broker piece written at the beginning of

the US subprime crisis, the precursor to the global financial crisis. This noted that the subprime mortgage market outstanding was only about 11% of the total US mortgage market. That turns out to have been a slight underestimate, I believe it was nearer 12% and the total of subprime mortgages was about \$1.3tr, close to 9% of 2008 GDP. But even then, it wasn't just the scale of the US subprime mortgage market that caused the damage. Instead, it was the incredibly tangled web of financial interlinkages that subsequently led to the complete loss of trust in interbank and other markets, which then shut down leading to a catastrophic drying up of market liquidity. Does anyone remember monoline insurance? Mortgage wraps? SPVs?

So yes, by all means, look at the scale of the underlying liabilities, but then ask yourself if that is the full extent of the problem?

In China's case, one factor that is somewhat encouraging, despite the clear evidence of excesses in the property development sector, is that this has not come after a sudden and dramatic surge in prices/activity. This does not appear to be a market bubble bursting, even if there is strong evidence of froth. Indeed, the latest policy measures that are a partial catalyst for what is going on are just an extension of previous measures put into motion long before the Covid-pandemic. What we are seeing now, is partly explained by a return to those deleveraging policies as the economy recovers, together with a tightening embodied in the "three red lines policy" for property companies which limits their debt accumulation and access to land auctions.

Those policies were designed to try to prevent the market from ever getting to a sub-prime type situation, but they don't preclude some market pain during periods like this. And maybe since the GFC, we have become so used to policymakers in the West sheltering us from any market hit with ever more accommodative policies, that our pain threshold has dropped. I could go on at length about that and how ultimately I think that the relentless attempt to smooth the business cycle and markets will ultimately cost more in lost output than occasional bouts of discomfort. But that can wait for another day.

The tendrils of China's property development companies will, for sure, extend deeper than just the property market and financials, though those alone are significant elements of the economy and certainly worth worrying about.

But what I think delivered the hammer blow during events such as those I've mentioned above, or for example, Japan's property bubble and subsequent bust is the degree to which financial interlinkages acted to create a domino-run as losses in one sector were transmitted to another and then another. For example, you can trace the beginnings of Japan's property bubble burst back to the innocuous-sounding "Jusen crisis" of local savings institutions. My guess is that while those interlinkages exist in China, they won't be quite as pervasive as they were in either the US or Japan back then.

And finally, given that there is an element of policy choice about this whole episode, there is perhaps a much greater ability for the authorities to turn back the policy dial on property development companies a few notches. Discussions about "moral hazard" are all well and good. But the consequences of corporate malfeasance in China are often severe. No one is talking about individuals being let off the hook in the event of some form of restructuring package. And given the recent pivot to "Common Prosperity", my guess is that any restructuring will aim to soften the blow for small investors - though again, the extent to which property has become a channel for household savings has perhaps grown to an unhealthy extent. That has been an issue in a number of historical global property crashes, including in Australia in the not too distant past. So some

lessons will also need to be learned here that property is not a risk-free investment asset for household savers.

If we want to look for historical comparisons to make sense of what is going on right now, perhaps we don't need to look too far. The Huarong restructuring earlier this year may be instructive. Here, the fate of the asset management company was left hanging for some time before a restructuring deal was eventually constructed. There was a palpable sense of warning in that wait - don't expect to suffer no losses - before the eventual rescue was put in place.

China is on vacation today and tomorrow, so global markets will likely continue to sweat through this one. And it is probably too early to anticipate much more than some soothing words when policymakers return on Thursday. But if Huarong is any guide, then the playbook for this will be an uncomfortable wait, but one that eventually delivers an outcome that is better than the worst fears that grow during that wait.

In the very short term, the easiest concrete measures that are likely to be taken are more PBoC liquidity injections. These, and the government's strong control over the banking system strongly suggest that a sudden liquidity loss like we witnessed during the global financial crisis, should be avoided.

Author

Alissa Lefebre

Economist

alissa.lefebvre@ing.com

Deepali Bhargava

Regional Head of Research, Asia-Pacific

Deepali.Bhargava@ing.com

Ruben Dewitte

Economist

+32495364780

ruben.dewitte@ing.com

Kinga Havasi

Economic research trainee

kinga.havasi@ing.com

Marten van Garderen

Consumer Economist, Netherlands

marten.van.garderen@ing.com

David Havrlant

Chief Economist, Czech Republic

420 770 321 486

david.havrlant@ing.com

Sander Burgers

Senior Economist, Dutch Housing
sander.burgers@ing.com

Lynn Song
Chief Economist, Greater China
lynn.song@asia.ing.com

Michiel Tukker
Senior European Rates Strategist
michiel.tukker@ing.com

Michal Rubaszek
Senior Economist, Poland
michal.rubaszek@ing.pl

This is a test author

Stefan Posea
Economist, Romania
tiberiu-stefan.posea@ing.com

Marine Leleux
Sector Strategist, Financials
marine.leleux2@ing.com

Jesse Norcross
Senior Sector Strategist, Real Estate
jesse.norcross@ing.com

Teise Stellema
Research Assistant, Energy Transition
teise.stellema@ing.com

Diederik Stadig
Sector Economist, TMT & Healthcare
diederik.stadig@ing.com

Diogo Gouveia
Sector Economist
diogo.duarte.vieira.de.gouveia@ing.com

Marine Leleux
Sector Strategist, Financials
marine.leleux2@ing.com

Ewa Manthey
Commodities Strategist

ewa.manthey@ing.com

ING Analysts

James Wilson

EM Sovereign Strategist

James.wilson@ing.com

Sophie Smith

Digital Editor

sophie.smith@ing.com

Frantisek Taborsky

EMEA FX & FI Strategist

frantisek.taborsky@ing.com

Adam Antoniak

Senior Economist, Poland

adam.antoniak@ing.pl

Min Joo Kang

Senior Economist, South Korea and Japan

min.joo.kang@asia.ing.com

Coco Zhang

ESG Research

coco.zhang@ing.com

Jan Frederik Slijkerman

Senior Sector Strategist, TMT

jan.frederik.slijkerman@ing.com

Katinka Jongkind

Senior Economist, Services and Leisure

Katinka.Jongkind@ing.com

Marina Le Blanc

Sector Strategist, Financials

Marina.Le.Blanc@ing.com

Samuel Abettan

Junior Economist

samuel.abettan@ing.com

Franziska Biehl

Economist, Germany

Franziska.Marie.Biehl@ing.de

Rebecca Byrne

Senior Editor and Supervisory Analyst

rebecca.byrne@ing.com

Mirjam Bani

Sector Economist, Commercial Real Estate & Public Sector (Netherlands)

mirjam.bani@ing.com

Timothy Rahill

Credit Strategist

timothy.rahill@ing.com

Leszek Kasek

Senior Economist, Poland

leszek.kasek@ing.pl

Oleksiy Soroka, CFA

Senior High Yield Credit Strategist

oleksiy.soroka@ing.com

Antoine Bouvet

Head of European Rates Strategy

antoine.bouvet@ing.com

Jeroen van den Broek

Global Head of Sector Research

jeroen.van.den.broek@ing.com

Edse Dantuma

Senior Sector Economist, Industry and Healthcare

edse.dantuma@ing.com

Francesco Pesole

FX Strategist

francesco.pesole@ing.com

Rico Luman

Senior Sector Economist, Transport and Logistics

Rico.Luman@ing.com

Jurjen Witteveen

Sector Economist

jurjen.witteveen@ing.com

Dmitry Dolgin

Chief Economist, CIS

dmitry.dolgin@ing.de

Nicholas Mapa

Senior Economist, Philippines

nicholas.antonio.mapa@asia.ing.com

Egor Fedorov

Senior Credit Analyst

egor.fedorov@ing.com

Sebastian Franke

Consumer Economist

sebastian.franke@ing.de

Gerben Hieminga

Senior Sector Economist, Energy

gerben.hieminga@ing.com

Nadège Tillier

Head of Corporates Sector Strategy

nadege.tillier@ing.com

Charlotte de Montpellier

Senior Economist, France and Switzerland

charlotte.de.montpellier@ing.com

Laura Straeter

Behavioural Scientist

+31(0)611172684

laura.Straeter@ing.com

Valentin Tataru

Chief Economist, Romania

valentin.tataru@ing.com

James Smith

Developed Markets Economist, UK

james.smith@ing.com

Suvi Platerink Kosonen

Senior Sector Strategist, Financials

suvi.platerink-kosonen@ing.com

Thijs Geijer

Senior Sector Economist, Food & Agri

thijs.geijer@ing.com

Maurice van Sante

Senior Economist Construction & Team Lead Sectors

maurice.van.sante@ing.com

Marcel Klok

Senior Economist, Netherlands

marcel.klok@ing.com

Piotr Poplawski

Senior Economist, Poland

piotr.poplawski@ing.pl

Paolo Pizzoli

Senior Economist, Italy, Greece

paolo.pizzoli@ing.com

Marieke Blom

Chief Economist and Global Head of Research

marieke.blom@ing.com

Raoul Leering

Senior Macro Economist

raoul.leering@ing.com

Maarten Leen

Head of Global IFRS9 ME Scenarios

maarten.leen@ing.com

Maureen Schuller

Head of Financials Sector Strategy

Maureen.Schuller@ing.com

Warren Patterson

Head of Commodities Strategy

Warren.Patterson@asia.ing.com

Rafal Benecki

Chief Economist, Poland

rafal.benecki@ing.pl

Philippe Ledent

Senior Economist, Belgium, Luxembourg

philippe.ledent@ing.com

Peter Virovacz

Senior Economist, Hungary

peter.virovacz@ing.com

Inga Fechner

Senior Economist, Germany, Global Trade

inga.fechner@ing.de

Dimitry Fleming

Senior Data Analyst, Netherlands

Dimitry.Fleming@ing.com

Ciprian Dascalu

Chief Economist, Romania

+40 31 406 8990

ciprian.dascalu@ing.com

Muhammet Mercan

Chief Economist, Turkey

muhammet.mercan@ingbank.com.tr

Iris Pang

Chief Economist, Greater China

iris.pang@asia.ing.com

Sophie Freeman

Writer, Group Research

+44 20 7767 6209

Sophie.Freeman@uk.ing.com

Padhraic Garvey, CFA

Regional Head of Research, Americas

padhraic.garvey@ing.com

James Knightley

Chief International Economist, US

james.knightley@ing.com

Tim Condon

Asia Chief Economist

+65 6232-6020

Martin van Vliet

Senior Interest Rate Strategist

+31 20 563 8801

martin.van.vliet@ing.com

Karol Pogorzelski

Senior Economist, Poland

Karol.Pogorzelski@ing.pl

Carsten Brzeski

Global Head of Macro

carsten.brzeski@ing.de

Viraj Patel

Foreign Exchange Strategist
+44 20 7767 6405
viraj.patel@ing.com

Owen Thomas
Global Head of Editorial Content
+44 (0) 207 767 5331
owen.thomas@ing.com

Bert Colijn
Chief Economist, Netherlands
bert.colijn@ing.com

Peter Vanden Houte
Chief Economist, Belgium, Luxembourg, Eurozone
peter.vandenhoute@ing.com

Benjamin Schroeder
Senior Rates Strategist
benjamin.schroeder@ing.com

Chris Turner
Global Head of Markets and Regional Head of Research for UK & CEE
chris.turner@ing.com

Gustavo Rangel
Chief Economist, LATAM
+1 646 424 6464
gustavo.rangel@ing.com

Carlo Cocuzzo
Economist, Digital Finance
+44 20 7767 5306
carlo.cocuzzo@ing.com