

The bias behind monetary policymaking

Minutes from the Federal Reserve meeting tonight may go some way to explaining why the bank left interest rates on hold in May. But to really understand the decision, and other central bank actions around the world, we may need to look at the policymakers themselves



Source: Shutterstock

Each month, the interest rate setting committees of central banks typically meet to decide whether to change key interest rates. While these committee members have large amounts of data available to help them reach a decision that is as objective as possible, researchers are investigating the role of more subjective factors like past experiences and cognitive biases such as loss aversion and inertia to explain hawkish and dovish behaviour.

These behavioural effects may be significant, especially where decisions can be split between action and no change.

Consider the situation faced by the central banks of neighbouring New Zealand and Australia recently this month. The [Reserve Bank of New Zealand](#) cut the official cash rate to 1.5% while the [Reserve Bank of Australia](#) kept its cash rate unchanged at 1.5%.

Factors specific to each country undoubtedly played a role in the different decisions but each noted risks of slower growth in the global economy and in domestic consumer spending. However,

research suggests those making decisions on interest rates may be affected by more than direct evidence. Behavioural factors may come into play, such as the past inflation experience of policy makers and differing levels of loss aversion.

These observations imply that the depiction of individual policy makers as hawks (i.e. being inclined to take steps to prevent higher inflation) and doves (i.e. those inclined towards accepting the possibility of higher inflation) may need to be expanded to include another avian species: pigeons, who sit on the fence and could swing either way.

Inflation memories

The financial professionals who have been appointed to the monetary policy committee (MPC) will be expected to use their wealth of knowledge and analytical experience to decide whether to change interest rates.

However, just as consumers and investors are susceptible to cognitive biases, central bankers may also be vulnerable. [Ulrike Malmendier, Stefan Angel and Zhen Yan](#) set out to test their hypothesis that the beliefs about future inflation and consequently, the decisions of the members of the US Federal Reserve's Board of Governors are influenced by the inflation experiences they have had during their lifetime.

In their experiment, they built an economic model that incorporated lifetime inflation experience to forecast each board member's voting behaviour. They compared those forecasts with members' votes between March 1951 and January 2014 and found that those with more exposure to inflation in the past were more likely to have hawkish voting patterns. The effect was striking: someone who had an above-average experience with inflation was one third more likely to take a hawkish stance that went against the committee majority, and also one third less likely to take a dovish stance.

In other words, if governors lived as adults through periods of high inflation, such as the 1970s, they tended to be much more fearful of runaway prices than if they came of age during later decades, when inflation was largely under control.

Metamorphosis caused by inertia and loss aversion

A key feature of central bank activity since the global financial crisis has seen policies aimed at supporting the economy. This has led to long periods of very low interest rates and use of alternative forms of policy such as quantitative easing. Reversing these approaches has proved difficult. Some may claim inertia has affected members of the policy committees. Some research supports this idea.

A [paper by Donato Masciandaro](#) argues that an increased sense of loss aversion felt by individual monetary policy committee members may lead to inertia in policy setting.

When loss aversion increases, doves on the policy committee overestimate the losses that would flow from taking actions aimed at encouraging inflation. As a result, they do not rush to cut rates. Meanwhile, hawks overestimate the losses that might come from raising interest rates, and shy away from taking action. In effect, increasing loss aversion decreases the difference between hawks and doves. In Masciandaro's view, monetary policy committees can be better described as being populated by pigeons, rather than hawks or doves.

One factor that may increase loss aversion is increased uncertainty about conditions in the economy. Evidence from [Hites Ahir, Nicholas Bloom and David Furceri](#) suggests uncertainty about conditions in the global economy has increased. If this has contributed to increased loss aversion by members of central bank policy committees, this may also have contributed to policy inertia.

Impact on consumers

While consumers typically don't need to worry about how interest rates are set, they are clearly affected by the decisions. Monetary policy influences mortgage and other loan repayments, as well as economic growth, inflation and unemployment.

The level of interest rates can also affect the behaviour of consumers. Research [suggests](#) the amount of risk individual investors are prepared to take increases as rates fall, especially to historically low levels, as they have in many countries since the global financial crisis. This can act as an added tool to boost growth but could also encourage excessive risk-taking, which may threaten financial stability.

Are algorithms the answer?

Behavioural bias is hard to escape, often resulting in bad decisions and costly outcomes. But is there a way to overcome it? Nobel-prize winning economist Daniel Kahneman thinks the answer could lie in algorithms and rules-based decision-making, which he says outperforms expert judgement.

In his 2011 book, 'Thinking, Fast and Slow,' he says the accuracy of predictions could be maximised if final decisions were "left mostly to formulas". But which formulas? The Federal Reserve argues there are a lot to choose from. And while rules provide ["useful benchmarks,"](#) the central bank insists that following them mechanically would not capture the complexity of the US economy.

For now, at least, deliberation and discretion still rule the day.

Author

Amrita Naik Nimbalkar

Junior Economist, Global Macro
amrita.naik.nimbalkar@ing.com

Mateusz Sutowicz

Senior Economist, Poland
mateusz.sutowicz@ing.pl

Alissa Lefebvre

Economist
alissa.lefebvre@ing.com

Deepali Bhargava

Regional Head of Research, Asia-Pacific
Deepali.Bhargava@ing.com

Ruben Dewitte

Economist

+32495364780

ruben.dewitte@ing.com

Kinga Havasi

Economic research trainee

kinga.havasi@ing.com

Marten van Garderen

Consumer Economist, Netherlands

marten.van.garderen@ing.com

David Havrlant

Chief Economist, Czech Republic

420 770 321 486

david.havrlant@ing.com

Sander Burgers

Senior Economist, Dutch Housing

sander.burgers@ing.com

Lynn Song

Chief Economist, Greater China

lynn.song@asia.ing.com

Michiel Tukker

Senior European Rates Strategist

michiel.tukker@ing.com

Michal Rubaszek

Senior Economist, Poland

michal.rubaszek@ing.pl

This is a test author

Stefan Posea

Economist, Romania

tiberiu-stefan.posea@ing.com

Marine Leleux

Sector Strategist, Financials

marine.leleux2@ing.com

Jesse Norcross

Senior Sector Strategist, Real Estate

jesse.norcross@ing.com

Teise Stellema

Research Assistant, Energy Transition

teise.stellema@ing.com

Diederik Stadig

Sector Economist, TMT & Healthcare

diederik.stadig@ing.com

Diogo Gouveia

Sector Economist

diogo.duarte.vieira.de.gouveia@ing.com

Marine Leleux

Sector Strategist, Financials

marine.leleux2@ing.com

Ewa Manthey

Commodities Strategist

ewa.manthey@ing.com

ING Analysts

James Wilson

EM Sovereign Strategist

James.wilson@ing.com

Sophie Smith

Digital Editor

sophie.smith@ing.com

Frantisek Taborsky

EMEA FX & FI Strategist

frantisek.taborsky@ing.com

Adam Antoniak

Senior Economist, Poland

adam.antoniak@ing.pl

Min Joo Kang

Senior Economist, South Korea and Japan

min.joo.kang@asia.ing.com

Coco Zhang

ESG Research

coco.zhang@ing.com

Jan Frederik Slijkerman

Senior Sector Strategist, TMT
jan.frederik.slijkerman@ing.com

Katinka Jongkind
Senior Economist, Services and Leisure
Katinka.Jongkind@ing.com

Marina Le Blanc
Sector Strategist, Financials
Marina.Le.Blanc@ing.com

Samuel Abettan
Junior Economist
samuel.abettan@ing.com

Franziska Biehl
Senior Economist, Germany
Franziska.Marie.Biehl@ing.de

Rebecca Byrne
Senior Editor and Supervisory Analyst
rebecca.byrne@ing.com

Mirjam Bani
Sector Economist, Commercial Real Estate & Public Sector (Netherlands)
mirjam.bani@ing.com

Timothy Rahill
Credit Strategist
timothy.rahill@ing.com

Leszek Kasek
Senior Economist, Poland
leszek.kasek@ing.pl

Oleksiy Soroka, CFA
Senior High Yield Credit Strategist
oleksiy.soroka@ing.com

Antoine Bouvet
Head of European Rates Strategy
antoine.bouvet@ing.com

Jeroen van den Broek
Global Head of Sector Research
jeroen.van.den.broek@ing.com

Edse Dantuma

Senior Sector Economist, Industry and Healthcare
edse.dantuma@ing.com

Francesco Pesole
FX Strategist
francesco.pesole@ing.com

Rico Luman
Senior Sector Economist, Transport and Logistics
Rico.Luman@ing.com

Jurjen Witteveen
Sector Economist
jurjen.witteveen@ing.com

Dmitry Dolgin
Chief Economist, CIS
dmitry.dolgin@ing.de

Nicholas Mapa
Senior Economist, Philippines
nicholas.antonio.mapa@asia.ing.com

Egor Fedorov
Senior Credit Analyst
egor.fedorov@ing.com

Sebastian Franke
Consumer Economist
sebastian.franke@ing.de

Gerben Hieminga
Senior Sector Economist, Energy
gerben.hieminga@ing.com

Nadège Tillier
Head of Corporates Sector Strategy
nadege.tillier@ing.com

Charlotte de Montpellier
Senior Economist, France and Switzerland
charlotte.de.montpellier@ing.com

Laura Straeter
Behavioural Scientist
+31(0)611172684
laura.Straeter@ing.com

Valentin Tataru

Chief Economist, Romania

valentin.tataru@ing.com

James Smith

Developed Markets Economist, UK

james.smith@ing.com

Suvi Platerink Kosonen

Senior Sector Strategist, Financials

suvi.platerink-kosonen@ing.com

Thijs Geijer

Senior Sector Economist, Food & Agri

thijs.geijer@ing.com

Maurice van Sante

Senior Economist Construction & Team Lead Sectors

maurice.van.sante@ing.com

Marcel Klok

Senior Economist, Netherlands

marcel.klok@ing.com

Piotr Poplawski

Senior Economist, Poland

piotr.poplawski@ing.pl

Paolo Pizzoli

Senior Economist, Italy, Greece

paolo.pizzoli@ing.com

Marieke Blom

Chief Economist and Global Head of Research

marieke.blom@ing.com

Raoul Leering

Senior Macro Economist

raoul.leering@ing.com

Maarten Leen

Head of Global IFRS9 ME Scenarios

maarten.leen@ing.com

Maureen Schuller

Head of Financials Sector Strategy

Maureen.Schuller@ing.com

Warren Patterson

Head of Commodities Strategy

Warren.Patterson@asia.ing.com

Rafal Benecki

Chief Economist, Poland

rafal.benecki@ing.pl

Philippe Ledent

Senior Economist, Belgium, Luxembourg

philippe.ledent@ing.com

Peter Virovacz

Senior Economist, Hungary

peter.virovacz@ing.com

Inga Fechner

Senior Economist, Germany, Global Trade

inga.fechner@ing.de

Dimitry Fleming

Senior Data Analyst, Netherlands

Dimitry.Fleming@ing.com

Ciprian Dascalu

Chief Economist, Romania

+40 31 406 8990

ciprian.dascalu@ing.com

Muhammet Mercan

Chief Economist, Turkey

muhammet.mercan@ingbank.com.tr

Iris Pang

Chief Economist, Greater China

iris.pang@asia.ing.com

Sophie Freeman

Writer, Group Research

+44 20 7767 6209

Sophie.Freeman@uk.ing.com

Padhraic Garvey, CFA

Regional Head of Research, Americas

padhraic.garvey@ing.com

James Knightley

Chief International Economist, US

james.knightley@ing.com

Tim Condon

Asia Chief Economist
+65 6232-6020

Martin van Vliet

Senior Interest Rate Strategist
+31 20 563 8801
martin.van.vliet@ing.com

Karol Pogorzelski

Senior Economist, Poland
Karol.Pogorzelski@ing.pl

Carsten Brzeski

Global Head of Macro
carsten.brzeski@ing.de

Viraj Patel

Foreign Exchange Strategist
+44 20 7767 6405
viraj.patel@ing.com

Owen Thomas

Global Head of Editorial Content
+44 (0) 207 767 5331
owen.thomas@ing.com

Bert Colijn

Chief Economist, Netherlands
bert.colijn@ing.com

Peter Vanden Houte

Chief Economist, Belgium, Luxembourg, Eurozone
peter.vandenhoute@ing.com

Benjamin Schroeder

Senior Rates Strategist
benjamin.schroeder@ing.com

Chris Turner

Global Head of Markets and Regional Head of Research for UK & CEE
chris.turner@ing.com

Gustavo Rangel

Chief Economist, LATAM
+1 646 424 6464

gustavo.rangel@ing.com

Carlo Cocuzzo

Economist, Digital Finance

+44 20 7767 5306

carlo.cocuzzo@ing.com