

Italy: No request (yet) for Excessive Deficit Procedure from the EU Commission

The agreement between the Italian government and the EU Commission was made possible by more realistic growth forecasts from the Italian side and a sharp cut in the planned structural balance increase from 0.8% of GDP to zero



Source: Shutterstock

The Italian government and the EU Commission reached an eleventh-hour agreement on the budget for 2019, which will allow Italy to avoid an Excessive Deficit Procedure (EDP), at least for the time being.

A more conciliatory approach by Italy

Having twice submitted a draft budget targeting a headline 2.4% deficit/GDP ratio, the Italian government had to come to terms with reality when the EU Commission finally rejected the Italian proposal and added a credible threat to start soon a debt-driven EDP against Italy. The market

reaction to the increased risk of the procedure and the deteriorating economic environment induced the two main stakeholders of the Italian government, Luigi Di Maio, the leader of the 5SM, and Matteo Salvini, the leader of the League, to seriously look for a compromise with Brussels. Evidence from opinion polls that Italians were increasingly in favour of a compromise and the latest Eurobarometer's indication that support for the euro among Italians jumped by 12 percentage points in 2018 also had a say in the process, in our view. On the Commission front, French fiscal developments as a result of the "yellow vests" protest likely helped Commissioner Moscovici and German Chancellor Merkel to smooth the stance of the northern hardliners.

A more prominent role for PM Conte, with support from President Mattarella

Another factor which helped in the negotiation process was a more orderly approach on the Italian side, with PM Conte playing a more prominent role in the process in close cooperation with President Mattarella, who acted as a quiet warden of the Italian Constitution. The negotiating process reportedly ended yesterday and the positive outcome was announced earlier today in a press conference by the Commission's Vice President Dombrovskis and by Commissioner Moscovici. The former deemed the solution as not ideal, as it does not solve long-standing Italian economic problems, but for the time being is enough to prevent the opening of a debt-driven EDP, provided that agreed measures will be fully implemented. The Commission will thus be closely monitoring relevant developments and will stand ready to reconsider the opportunity to open the procedure in January 2019 should Italy fail to keep its promises.

What are the terms of the agreement?

The agreement between the Italian government and the Commission builds on two strongholds: the downward revision by the Italian government of 2019 GDP growth forecasts from 1.5% to a more reasonable (but still very ambitious) 1% and a sharp downsizing of the projected fiscal push. In the new plan, the government foresees no change in the structural deficit/GDP ratio (from a 0.8% increase in the previous draft). As pre-announced over the past week, the new headline deficit/GDP ratio will be an unconventional 2.04% (from 2.4%), an optical illusion to distract voters from the underlying financial sacrifice.

According to PM Conte's address to the Senate, the projected deficit decline was obtained by a combination of measures. Firstly, through a re-worked (downward) estimation of the actual financial impact of both the citizenship income and the so-called level 100 pension rule, done while maintaining unaltered the pool of eligible citizens and the planned implementation timeline. In addition, the government will reduce indexation on pensions above a certain threshold and will trim so-called "golden pensions" via a temporary solidarity contribution scaled by income brackets. Referring to the revenue side, PM Conte announced the reduction of some tax credits and a set of measures increasing taxation on gaming and betting. As a sort of safeguard clause meant to ensure Italy's compliance with the new fiscal targets, the Government will also submit to the Italian Parliament a norm foreseeing the temporary ring-fencing of some €2bn of budgeted expenditures, which will be freed up over 2019 if it is not needed.

In his address, PM Conte also confirmed that Italy requested and obtained fiscal flexibility for an amount of 0.2% of GDP for a plan of investment targeted at the consolidation of road infrastructure and for risk management of hydro-geologic risks.

Short-term positive as EDP risk reduced...

The agreement is clearly a short-term positive and should allow the Italian government to speed up the so far delayed approval of the budget law within the end-of-year deadline. Barring extreme developments, the perspective of an (unlikely, but still possible) excessive deficit procedure now seems more likely in correspondence with the Spring publication of realized 2018 fiscal data. This should in principle help reduce the risk of an overlap with the looming European Parliament election.

...but likely ineffective in propelling growth perspectives

What the agreement does not do, in our view, is create conditions for higher potential growth, the key factor needed to secure debt sustainability. Doubts about the actual expansionary potential of the budget are confirmed now that the fiscal thrust is brought to zero. If the ongoing market re-pricing of the risk of a clash with Europe continues this would eventually filter through banks' balance sheets and, ultimately, on lending rates to the private sector and credit availability and, possibly, on confidence, with potential beneficial effects on private demand. Based on little available information, we suspect that private consumption might benefit most, while businesses, would need more visibility on political developments before revising upwards their investment plans. We thus believe that our current Italian 0.8% GDP growth forecast for 2019 remains exposed to non-negligible downside risks.

Author

Paolo Pizzoli

Senior Economist, Italy, Greece

paolo.pizzoli@ing.com

Disclaimer

This publication has been prepared by the Economic and Financial Analysis Division of ING Bank N.V. ("ING") solely for information purposes without regard to any particular user's investment objectives, financial situation, or means. *ING forms part of ING Group (being for this purpose ING Group N.V. and its subsidiary and affiliated companies).* The information in the publication is not an investment recommendation and it is not investment, legal or tax advice or an offer or solicitation to purchase or sell any financial instrument. Reasonable care has been taken to ensure that this publication is not untrue or misleading when published, but ING does not represent that it is accurate or complete. ING does not accept any liability for any direct, indirect or consequential loss arising from any use of this publication. Unless otherwise stated, any views, forecasts, or estimates are solely those of the author(s), as of the date of the publication and are subject to change without notice.

The distribution of this publication may be restricted by law or regulation in different jurisdictions and persons into whose possession this publication comes should inform themselves about, and observe, such restrictions.

Copyright and database rights protection exists in this report and it may not be reproduced, distributed or published by any person for any purpose without the prior express consent of ING. All rights are reserved. ING Bank N.V. is authorised by the Dutch Central Bank and supervised by the European Central Bank (ECB), the Dutch Central Bank (DNB) and the Dutch Authority for the Financial Markets (AFM). ING Bank N.V. is incorporated in the Netherlands (Trade Register no. 33031431 Amsterdam). In the United Kingdom this information is approved and/or communicated by ING Bank N.V., London Branch. ING Bank N.V., London Branch is authorised by the Prudential Regulation Authority and is subject to regulation by the Financial Conduct Authority and limited regulation by the Prudential Regulation Authority. ING Bank N.V., London branch is registered in England (Registration number BR000341) at 8-10 Moorgate, London EC2 6DA. For US Investors: Any person wishing to discuss this report or effect transactions in any security discussed herein should contact ING Financial Markets LLC, which is a member of the NYSE, FINRA and SIPC and part of ING, and which has accepted responsibility for the distribution of this report in the United States under applicable requirements.

Additional information is available on request. For more information about ING Group, please visit www.ing.com.